



DOI: 10.2478/abcsj-2018-0011

José Luís Jobim, ed. *Literary and Cultural Circulation*. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 2017, v. 1. (£55.00). Pp 383. ISBN: 978-1-78707-324-1.

*Literary and Cultural Circulation* is made up of eighteen chapters by different authors who explore this broad issue through different frameworks. Consequently, the meaning of literary circulation varies throughout the volume, according to the purposes of each text and the specificities of each object of analysis. The quality of the essays is undeniable and, despite the differences between them, circulation, considered in its broadest sense, is the main subject explored in the texts that vary, in short, around two main aspects. One of them is the perspective from which circulation is understood. In this respect, the essays can be divided into four main thematic axes that address the role of circulation: 1) in specific authors or for a specific genre, 2) in the postcolonial condition, 3) in our times, that is, in the digital and culture industry age, and 4) in the formation of a national interpretation. Since the starting point determines the point of arrival and the specific results of circulation, the texts also differ from one another in terms of the various implications of circulation taken into account. Thus, various essays discuss the consequences of circulation for literary production, for the expression of subaltern groups, for the acclimatization of European ideas in the Americas, for reading, for culture and for literature, approaching also the theoretical issues that surround this subject as well as the methodological and market implications of this propensity of literature to circulate.

Due to the very size of this book, it would not be possible to present the main ideas of all the essays. I will try instead to present the ideas of at least one of the essays from each axis. The contributors are scholars and/or professors from different countries (United States, Brazil and Spain) who, as I noted, have dealt with this academic and cultural debate in different ways in their research. Diversity, a hallmark of literary

circulation itself, is also a hallmark of this collection; therefore, reading it is a singular and enriching experience.

The essays “Untimeliness, Recognition and Respect in the Work of Gonçalo Tavares” by Helena Carvalhão Buescu, “Cultural Circulation and the Age of Cultures in Witold Gombrowicz” by Olga Kempinska, “Dutch Literature and World Literature” by Theo D’haen, and “Machado de Assis: The Theater of the World” by Kenneth David Jackson, as the titles suggest, approach literary circulation through specific case studies, analyzing works and authors coming from diverse literatures and countries. Carvalhão Buescu, in “Untimeliness, Recognition and Respect in the Work of Gonçalo Tavares,” for example, uses the concept of untimeliness to refer to events, themes and forms of the past that, although historically distant, continue to circulate and are constantly appropriated by literature in other contexts. According to the author, the ability of some cultural phenomena to occur in different historical contexts gives them an intermittent duration and illustrates a specific and complex mode of literary circulation. From this perspective, the essay focuses on the specific case of the Portuguese novel by Gonçalo Tavares, *A Girl Is Lost in Her Century in Search of the Father*, which reuses anachronistic and even unrelated elements of 21<sup>st</sup>-century Portugal, such as Nazism and the notion of cosmopolitanism.

If, in this essay, temporality is the starting point for literary circulation, in Kempinska’s text, “Cultural Circulation and the Age of Cultures in Witold Gombrowicz,” temporality and its implications to circulation are considered from the angle of Witold Gombrowicz, a Polish writer who settled in Argentina. Kempinska focuses her analysis on Gombrowicz’s diaries, in which he transposes the distinction between cultures to the domain of age-related experience. According to Kempinska, Gombrowicz relativizes the superiority of mature cultures which, to him, also imply the existence of crystallized forms that, when in circulation, are imposed on immature cultures. Immaturity, in turn, could point to a relative lack of weight of the past heritage and its forms, which makes it possible to avoid imitation. From where I write (Brazil, a country which would also be deemed immature in Gombrowicz’ terms), it is impossible not to see in these considerations the lesson of our modernist

poets (to be taken up again by Jobim's text): our submission to literary forms inherited from mature cultures has limits, or rather, our submission is authentic.

Finally, in "In Search of a Land of Happiness: Utopia and Its Discontents," Zhang Longxi deals with the role of circulation in terms of a specific genre. He addresses, among other matters, the circulation of utopian fiction and its subsequent exhaustion and replacement by dystopian or anti-utopian writings, a phenomenon considered by the author in social and historical terms. In analyzing the circulation of the desire for a better life, the author also presents a rich historical and cultural panorama.

The essays "Some Considerations on Processes of Literary Circulation: The Indigenous Cultural Matrix within the Brazilian Cultural Matrix" by Fábio Almeida de Carvalho, "'Tupy or not tupy that is the question': the Void and the Question of Literary and Cultural Circulation in Amazônia: Considerations on a Literature 'without a character'" by Roberto Mibielli, "Revisiting Transculturation in Latin America: The Case of Marvelous Realism" by Eduardo F. Coutinho, "Cannibalism as Cultural Appropriation: From Caliban to the Cannibalist Manifesto" by José Luís Jobim, and "The Brazilian Encyclopaedia, Language Policy and the Circulation of Ideas about the Democratization of Culture: Mário de Andrade (1939) and Eurialo Canabrava (1957)" by Bethania Mariani, start from the assumption that the circulation of human thought is not exempt from hierarchy. From a post-colonial perspective, Almeida de Carvalho, Mibielli, Coutinho and Jobim focus on the process of circulation of historically silenced voices.

In "Some Considerations on Processes of Literary Circulation: The Indigenous Cultural Matrix within the Brazilian Cultural Matrix," Almeida de Carvalho problematizes the circulation, in diverse spaces, of the elements with an alleged origin in an indigenous cultural matrix. From a case report (Projeto Anikê's activities that occurred in the Federal University of Roraima), the text describes processes of transcultural and translinguistic translation, but without neglecting their contradictions. As a result, these processes can be understood not only as cultural and pedagogical phenomena, but also as market phenomena. Mibielli also

focuses on the Amazon, whose constitutive cultural plurality is at the heart of his reflection. Relying on the testimonies of several actors involved in the process of producing Amazonian textualities, this essay seeks to explore not only some aspects of the literature produced there (by tracing, for this purpose, its influences), but also the way the discourse about the region is constructed and circulated.

In “Revisiting Transculturation in Latin America: The Case of Marvelous Realism,” Coutinho focuses on one of the consequences of European aesthetic forms and theoretic formulations and their circulation in Latin America: a critical appropriation that results neither in indiscriminate importation nor in autochthonism, but in something original. The author illustrates this dynamic with the case of marvelous realism, which is explained as a result of the mixture between distinct forms of the European fantastic with aspects coming from indigenous and Afro-American cultures. García Marquez’s *One Hundred Years of Solitude* serves as a demonstration of the particularities and effects of marvelous realism.

Also interested in cultural appropriation, Jobim, in “Cannibalism as Cultural Appropriation: From Caliban to the Cannibalist Manifesto,” first approaches the circulation of the idea of cannibalism, especially in Pietro d’Anghiera and Montaigne’s essays and then argues about its subsequent appropriation by Latin American essays and by Oswald de Andrade’s *Cannibalist Manifesto*. In relation to the latter, the focus is on the idea of anthropophagy as cultural consumption. In the former case, the reinterpretation of Shakespeare’s play *The Tempest* through one of its main characters, Caliban, is one of its main interests. In this case, the disqualification of the native language by the colonizer is only one of the aspects addressed, which will be taken up again by the linguist Mariani in “The Brazilian Encyclopaedia, Language Policy and the Circulation of Ideas about the Democratization of Culture: Mário de Andrade (1939) and Eurialo Canabrava (1957),” an essay on two projects for a Brazilian encyclopedia. From the perspective of discourse analysis (DA), she draws attention to the need to consider the encyclopedias as linguistic instruments which are historically, socially and ideologically determined. They function as instruments that allow the circulation of an

institutionalized and often homogenized knowledge, linked to a policy of national unity. To illustrate the argument, Mariani retrieves the context of production of the two encyclopedias referred to in the essay's title, while also commenting on their structure, priorities and target audiences.

Begoña Regueiro, Amelia Sanz and Miriam Llama's "Literatures for a Global Imaginary: The Circulation of Digital Literature in Spanish," Laura Sánchez Gómez's "E-books in Spanish: A Global Object in Circulation" and Fabio Akcelrud Durão's "Circulation as Constitutive Principle" address the role of circulation in our times. The first two essays deal with the relevant matter of whether and how literature (especially in its modes of production, distribution and circulation), literary studies and the ways of reading can be influenced by the technological advances in the globalized world. In "Circulation as Constitutive Principle," Durão looks at changes in the patterns of literary production and circulation, considering the influx of the universalization of the culture industry instead of the interference of electronic tools. Regarding literature and culture in their class formation, constantly produced by reality and constantly producing it, Durão notes how circulation went from an extrinsic experience to a constituent part of the literary object. In a context entirely ruled by the principle of exchange, literary production occurs with the objective of sale, and circulation becomes, in Durão's view, a structuring narrative category. As the homogenization of narrative production is the consequence of cultural commodification, Durão hypothesizes that commodification and circulation become equivalent to one another, so that "ambitious literary works, those that aspire to exist as singular entities, will have to develop strategies to defend themselves against their very ability to circulate" (Durão 64). The author concludes by confronting James Joyce's *Ulysses* with the problematic of circulation. By presenting a positive view of form as production, Durão reminds us that the refusal to enter the process of circulation does not necessarily result in paralysis.

Benjamin Abdala Junior's "Comparative Literature and Literary Circulation: Reflections on a Critical Trajectory," Paulo Moreira's "When America First Became Latin," Roberto Patrick Newcomb's "The Idea of Sobranceria in the Luso-Brazilian Essay of National Interpretation," and

Maria Elizabeth Chaves de Mello's "The Circulation of Ideas within Nineteenth-Century Literary Criticism between France and Brazil: The Role of Travellers" approach the role of circulation in the formation of a national interpretation and also the consequences of circulation for the acclimatization of European ideas in the Americas. In "Comparative Literature and Literary Circulation: Reflections on a Critical Trajectory," Abdala Junior identifies a dialogue built into the literary forms that circulate between Portuguese-speaking countries. He is interested, therefore, in the interaction between literatures and authors of the Ibero-Afro-American cultural melting pot. According to him, this kind of solidarity network forms a hybrid and open ecosystem which contrasts with the homogenization of the culture industry and the globalizing tendency of the English language. The author concludes his essay by reiterating the importance of the comparative study of these literatures, "given the asymmetry of globalizing flows and of the prestige of their market entanglements" (Abdala Junior 196).

Moreira's and Newcomb's contributions ("When America First Became Latin" and "The Idea of Sobranceria in the Luso-Brazilian Essay of National Interpretation," respectively) address the role of circulation in the interpretation of the idea of nationality. Moreira investigates the genealogy of the idea of Latin America through the presentation of authors such as Michel Chevalier and Hugues Felicité Robert de Lamennais. Moreira also demonstrates how they refer to economic and political issues based on cultural arguments, a subject also dealt with by Newcomb, who investigates the use of the term "sobrancería" by three Luso-Brazilian intellectuals (J.P. de Oliveira Martins, Manoel Bomfim e Sérgio Buarque de Holanda). Newcomb is interested in the Iberian roots, more specifically Portuguese, of Brazilian civilization. For this reason, he demonstrates how the term "sobrancería" was deterritorialized in order to describe characteristics of the Latin American character, commenting on the specificities that the term acquires in each of the authors. Another example of the acclimatization of European ideas in the Americas is Chaves de Mello's "The Circulation of Ideas within Nineteenth-Century Literary Criticism between France and Brazil: The Role of Travellers." Chaves de Mello provides an overview of the circulation of European

literary ideas in nineteenth-century Brazil. By showing how the affiliation to the French cultural matrix was an alternative to the old Portuguese matrix, the author reveals the importance of Ferdinand Denis, Auguste Comte, Madame de Staël and Hippolyte Taine in the formation of nineteenth-century nationalist thought, a mission paradoxically entrusted to our Romantics by Europe itself.

The essays discussed in this review show that this book provides a fruitful academic debate on literary circulation, one which I could only sketch here. Of course, this attempt to summarize the whole argument of *Literary and Cultural Circulation* by dividing it into four main thematic axes could not be entirely faithful to such diverse essays, since it fails to take into consideration the interdisciplinary character of the broader matter of circulation. Thus, any in-depth reading of the volume will make this division seem inconsistent, as the texts enter dialogues with one another and many of them encompass more than one of the aforementioned axes. In fact, it is very interesting that circulation has acquired such different meanings in the essays reviewed. In short, this suggests a tension within the category itself, a category whose meaning seems to be still in dispute. In this sense, the essays also serve to point out the predominant meanings involved in this dispute. Although the diversity of meanings of circulation in the essays can be seen as contradictory, this is not a weakness of the book; on the contrary, the book is interesting precisely because it brings to light the inherent strains of the category. If the division into four main thematic axes restricts the multifaceted aspects of the essays, I hope that it will at least make it possible to understand the ambitions underlying the general purpose of the entire book, which will certainly foster further studies and reflections.

CAMILA HESPANHOL PERUCHI  
University of Campinas (UNICAMP), Brazil